



Report

**Stakeholders Consultation
Phase-II Sub-Projects**

**Redevelopment of
Kakri Sports Complex and
Neighborhood Improvement &
Redevelopment of Kharadar
Locality**

**KARACHI NIEGHBORHOOD IMPROVEMENT
PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION UNIT
PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
GOVERNEMNT OF SINDH**

Introduction

Karachi Neighborhood Improvement Project believes in inclusive approach for implementation of sub-projects. In this regard, Stakeholders' engagement is an integral part for meaningful consultation with relevant stakeholders. In pursuance of this, KNIP through Design Consultants, have initiated the Public Consultations with various stakeholders in identified sub-projects.

The prime objective of the public consultation was to disseminate information about Karachi Neighborhood Improvement Project (KNIP), sharing the details of the Sub-Projects and Conceptual Designs and its features, scope of interventions with the primary and secondary stakeholders for their input and suggestions/feedback. So that it could be incorporated before final designs. Since the consultation process on Designs was underway and was continued till the completion of final designs. Present data shows the details of consultations which has been conducted so far on following sub-projects of Phase-II;

- Redevelopment of Kakri Sports Complex and Neighborhood Improvement,
- Redevelopment of Kharadar Locality.

S. #	Sub- Project	Target Group												
		Resident		Trader / Business Owner		Govt Departments/ Technical Experts		Mobile Vendors		NGO / CBO		Sports / Youth		Total
		Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	
1	Redevelopment of Kakri Sports Complex and Neighborhood Improvement	17	16	7	0	24	1	4	0	4	0	27	20	120
2	Redevelopment of Kharadar Locality	15	15	5	0	16	0	18	0	6	0	0	0	75
Target Group - Total		32	31	12	0	40	1	22	0	10	0	27	20	195
Target Group - %		16%	16%	6%	0%	21%	1%	11%	0%	5%	0%	14%	10%	100%
Gender No.			Men			143				Women			52	
Gender Wise %			Men			73%				Women			27%	



During consultations with stakeholders at Concept Design and Final Design Stage, worthy stakeholders shared their concerns, appreciations, views, suggestions. The brief findings of the public consultations sub-project wise conducted are as following:

Redevelopment of Kakri Sports Complex and Neighborhood Improvement:

The residents around Kakri Ground Complex informed that;

- The design be self-sufficient for separate rest rooms and provisions for female sports players
- Suggested CCTV cameras be installed in the playground.
- Suggested skilled and unskilled jobs for residents during construction
- Suggested maintenance budget for the sustainability of sub-project
- Residents suggested to keep the streets crossable during implementation works
- Residents also raised concern related to traffic jam due to the project in the area
- A committee should be constituted to supervise the project and monitor the activities being conducted as per design
- Provision of wooden benches from boundary facing to the Pritchard Road.

The residents around Pritchard Park suggested that;

- No any sitting arrangement is required from main gate, as people may not have any sight of balconies of the buildings facing to park.
- Appreciated the final designs of the Triangular Park.
- Park has water supply line from KW&SB may not be disturbed, through which currently water is received on alternative day.
- Regular trimming of the trees.
- Fixation of the park in evening time and on Sunday for the female residents only.
- Fixation of notice board showing the schedule.
- Boundary walls must be quiet enough that outsiders may not jump into the park during off timings.
- Appreciated the provision of separate toilets for male and female in the drawings and designs.
- Appreciated the provision of lightning in the park, which will secure family visits at night timing as well.

The football, boxing and karate sports persons suggested that;

- Informed that Jafa Football Academy is operating since 2006 and is providing footfall training to boys and girls of the area along with free of cost Computer and English Language courses. Suggested to have the provision of Academy in the design having two rooms, indoor play area and ground for practice. They are currently using the adjacent ground area for practice and having office with two rooms and indoor play area. Also emphasized on to retain the mature tree available within nursery.
- Appreciated the sub-project design and suggested to keep two pavilions of football ground to accommodate maximum spectators.
- Cherished the design for the betterment of the area. Suggested to focus on the games being played in the area. She emphasized on Football, Boxing, Karate and Athletics, however Swimming and Tennis is not well-known in the area.
- Suggested to have an Academy, enabling player proper coaching and training.
- Submitted to have a separate mosque for females within the ground.
- Emphasized on the design of boxing ring to meet international standards.

- Suggested design to cater with safety and security features for females. Separate washrooms, setting arrangements, mosque etc.
- Also suggested controlled gates to monitor entrance and exit through effective system.
- The female players suggested design to cater with safety and security features for females. The security for female visitors and female players will facilitate large influx of women visitors and players and family scale visitation.
- The female players suggested to provide separate toilets and sitting arrangements.
- The female participants suggested controlled gates to monitor entrance and exit through effective system.
- The participants raised the cleanliness issues of the area and suggested to have interventions for beautification of surrounding area Neighborhood.
- The designs of Kakri should have availability of mosques. Consultant informed that there is already a masjid just outside the ground.
- The designs should be self-sufficient for separate rest rooms and dress changing rooms for female sports players..
- The designs should also be well-worse for separate lavatories for female players.
- The boxing arena should be designed at international standards

The business community informed that;

- They appreciated the sub-project interventions. They were mainly concerned due to existing issue of car/bikes parking in the area and suggested interventions to have provisions of proper parking.
- Kakri ground adjacent drain should be covered as this is the main source of breeding habitats for diseases. Consultant team briefed them the covering of drain is not their scope. Consultant noted for discussion with the relevant department to improve drainage network in the area.
- The business owners agreed that the sub-project will improve their businesses and everyday life.

The mobile vendors informed that;

- They do not have concerns about sub-project interventions, since their businesses are mobile and can easily be shifted if required.
- They also added that rehabilitation of Kakri ground will invite more crowd to the ground which will create an opportunity will increase their livelihood.

The government officials and managers of utilities and service providers suggested that;

- The officials of DMCs admired the interventions and ensured their coordination for smoothly implementation of the sub-project.
- Suggested new office for UC-6 (Moosa Lane) staff having access gate to Pritchard Road.
- The representative of K-Electric ensured the support and cooperation from the organization for marking the wiring network on GIS map as per K-Electric's Master Plan.

The World Bank's Advisor Committee suggested that;

- Activities of Multi-Purpose building should enhance the quality of life of residents in adjacent areas; the suggestion is well taken in redesigning of multipurpose building.
- The Traffic Management Plan should be implemented very carefully; mitigation measures for the traffic impacts are Environmental Mitigation and Monitoring Plan (ESMP) and Social Management and Monitoring Plan (SMMP).



- The committee showed concern on the path used by local residents as a thoroughfare; wherein committee was also updated that an alternate route is already available near Kakri ground along KMA Public School that will be used for pedestrian movement.
- The committee also suggested that Pritchard Triangular Park, located at the rear side of the Ground, could be used as a play area for the kids and women of adjacent community; since the park has very low area and roads from three sides. In order to avoid any incident, the park is taken up as a family park instead of Children Park, where children can also visit along their parents.
- It was suggested by one of the committee members that existing community patterns needs to be studied in depth; the baseline studies and consultation with local communities are carefully studied; the existing routes will not be disturbed.

Redevelopment of Kharadar Locality:

The residents suggested that;

- Provision of separate toilets for ladies in the public places, so the designs must ensure separate provision of female toilet in park.
- Provision of facility for females to conduct meetings, get-togethers and other recreational programs.
- Rehabilitation of Allah Rakha Park with particularly focusing gender aspects.
- Provision of lightening and CCTV cameras in park, enabling females to safely visit the park.
- Provision of street lightening within Kharadar.
- Improving the sewerage system of the area and placement of the waste dustbins in the public places.
- Provision of separate lane for the ambulances which increases the death ratio in the area.
- Increasing width of pedestrian paths and designs must be designed to avoid slippages from ground.

The business community informed that;

- The business communities were mainly concerned due to existing issue of car/bikes parking in the area and suggested interventions to have provisions of proper parking.
- The shopkeepers indicated about the poor drainage system causes mobility issues for consumers.
- The business related persons had concerns about construction works causing traffic congestion, dust and noise pollution, restricted access or temporary issues to pedestrians, residents and business community etc.

The mobile vendors informed that;

- They do not have concerns about sub-project interventions, since their businesses are mobile and can easily be shifted if required.

The government officials and managers of utilities and service providers suggested that;

- The officials of DMCs admired the interventions and ensured their coordination for smoothly implementation of the sub-project.
- The secretary of UC-25 (Kharadar) ensured full cooperation during implementation of proposed development works.
- The representatives from K-Electric ensured the support and cooperation from the organization for GIS mapping of the wiring network as per K-Electric's Master Plan.

The World Bank's Advisor Committee suggested that;

- There are more than one heritage building in this neighborhood and should be identified in next phase of design; the suggestion is well taken and revised field visits were conducted. About 07 heritage buildings including Wazir Mansion, Traffic Police Station Kharadar, Machi Miani Market, Sultan Mansion, Parak Chand Building, Katrak Terrace, 1922 and Jamshaid Katrak Chambers, 1932 were identified within the sub-project area.
- Additionally, the Antiquities Act of 1975 will be fully taken in account during implementation of proposed interventions. The law ensures the protection of nominated PCRs across Pakistan. The law prohibits new construction in the proximity (within a distance of **200 feet**) of a protected antiquity and empowers the Government of Pakistan to prohibit excavation in any area that may contain such articles of archaeological significance.
- Police Chowki is in the list of Heritage Buildings; very true – acknowledged, the heritage act will be taken in account.
- The area has a strong connection with Lea Market and it should be considered during the survey; the Lea Market is connected to the Kharadar sub-project through Embankment Road/Muhabat Khanjee Road.
- The poor road condition and lack of utilities are well considered during topographic surveys, social and environmental assessments and designing phase.
- For easiness to the main processions of 9th and 10th Muharram and 12th Rabiul-u-Awal that passes through Kharadar area every year are well considered and Rampard Row Road through Boltan Market Street Road and Main Imam Bargah to parking areas at Kakri are well considered for the redevelopment, street lightening, urban spaces etc.
- The case study of Lahore presented to the advisory group was an example. The residential and commercial activities are well considered for Kharadar.



1. Design Modification Matrix

Consultation Based Design Modification Matrix for **Redevelopment of Kakri Sports Complex and Neighborhood Improvement:**

Name	Recommendations/Suggestions	Actions to be taken	Design Modification
Background information of the Redevelopment of Kharadar Locality sub-project shared with the participants during consultation process	The design be self-sufficient for separate rest rooms and provisions for female sports players	Separate toilets for females	Included in the design
	Suggested CCTV cameras be installed in the playground.	CCTV Camera to be installed	Included in the design
	Suggested skilled and unskilled jobs for residents during construction	Skilled and unskilled jobs to be provided to residents	ESMP recommended skilled and unskilled jobs for residents
	Suggested maintenance budget for the sustainability of sub-project	Mechanism be devised for sustainability of the sub-project	Operation and maintenance cost included in the design
	Residents suggested to keep the streets crossable during implementation works	Pedestrian Management plan be devised for smooth movement of residents	Pedestrian Management plan included in the design
	Residents also raised concern related to traffic jam due to the project in the area	Traffic Management plan be devised for smooth movement of residents	Traffic Management plan included in the design
	A committee should be constituted to supervise the project and monitor the activities being conducted as per design	Committee be constituted for project supervision and monitoring	Supervision and monitoring included in the sub-project
	The design be self-sufficient for separate rest rooms and provisions for female sports players	Separate toilets for females	Included in the design
	Suggested CCTV cameras be installed in the playground.	CCTV Camera to be installed	Included in the design
	Suggested skilled and unskilled jobs for residents during construction	Skilled and unskilled jobs to be provided to residents	ESMP recommended skilled and unskilled jobs for residents
	Suggested maintenance budget for the sustainability of sub-project	Mechanism be devised for sustainability of the sub-project	Operation and maintenance cost included in the design
	Residents suggested to keep the streets crossable during implementation works	Pedestrian Management plan be devised for smooth movement of residents	Pedestrian Management plan included in the design
	Residents also raised concern related to traffic jam due to the project in the area	Traffic Management plan be devised for smooth movement of residents	Traffic Management plan included in the design
	A committee should be constituted to supervise the project and monitor the activities being conducted as per design	Committee be constituted for project supervision and monitoring	Supervision and monitoring included in the sub-project
	The design be self-sufficient for separate rest rooms and provisions for female sports players	Separate toilets for females	Included in the design



Name	Recommendations/Suggestions	Actions to be taken	Design Modification
	Suggested CCTV cameras be installed in the playground.	CCTV Camera to be installed	Included in the design
	Suggested skilled and unskilled jobs for residents during construction	Skilled and unskilled jobs to be provided to residents	ESMP recommended skilled and unskilled jobs for residents
	Suggested maintenance budget for the sustainability of sub-project	Mechanism be devised for sustainability of the sub-project	Operation and maintenance cost included in the design
	Residents suggested to keep the streets crossable during implementation works	Pedestrian Management plan be devised for smooth movement of residents	Pedestrian Management plan included in the design
	Residents also raised concern related to traffic jam due to the project in the area	Traffic Management plan be devised for smooth movement of residents	Traffic Management plan included in the design
	A committee should be constituted to supervise the project and monitor the activities being conducted as per design	Committee be constituted for project supervision and monitoring	Supervision and monitoring included in the sub-project
	Owners of mobile carts were not concerned about sub-project interventions, since their businesses are mobile and can easily be shifted if required. They also added that rehabilitation of Kakri ground will invite more crowd to the ground which will create an opportunity in increased livelihood and put positive impacts on their mobile vendoring small carts.	No action needed	No action needed
	The designs of Kakri should have availability of mosques. Consultant informed that there is already a masjid just outside the ground.	No action needed	No action needed
	The designs should be self-sufficient for separate rest rooms and dress changing rooms for female sports players..	Design to cater basic requirements for female players.	Included in the design
	The designs should also be well-worse for separate lavatories for female players.	Design to cater basic requirements for female players.	Included in the design
	The boxing arena should be designed at international standards	Design to meets the international standard	Design is based on international standard
	The officials of DMCs admired the interventions and ensured their coordination for smoothly implementation of the sub-project.	No action needed	No action needed



Name	Recommendations/Suggestions	Actions to be taken	Design Modification
	Suggested new office for UC-6 (Moosalane) staff having access gate to Pitchar road	New office to be included in the design	Included in the design
	The representative of K-Electric ensured the support and cooperation from the organization for marking the wiring network on GIS map as per K-Electric's Master Plan	No action needed	No action needed
	Labaik foundation appreciated the sub-project interventions and ensured their full cooperation and support.	No action needed	No action needed
	The trees in the nursery may not be unnecessarily cut.	The drawings to be revised and avoiding unnecessarily tree cut.	Drawing modified through reducing the size of the proposed multipurpose building
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provision of wooden benches from boundary facing to the Pritchard Road. No any sitting arrangement is required from main gate, as people may not have any sight of balconies of the buildings facing to park. 	In order to keep <i>pardah</i> and avoid any sight issue, the benches of Pritchard roadside boundary wall will be compensated in the western direction.	Included in design
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Appreciated the final designs of the Triangular Park. 	No response needed.	No action needed
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Park has water supply line from KW&SB may not be disturbed, through which currently water is received on alternative day. 	The designs do not disturb existing water supply line.	No action needed
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Regular trimming of the trees. Fixation of the park in evening time and on Sunday for the female residents only. Fixation of notice board showing the schedule. 	Need to be discussed with the Director and Deputy Director Parks of DMC South.	<p>The park administration already caters regular trimming of the plants.</p> <p>The timing for women will be specified after redevelopment of park.</p>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Boundary walls must be quiet enough that outsiders may not jump into the park during off timings. Appreciated the provision of separate toilets for male and female in the drawings and designs. 	The designs already cater the concern of female resident.	No action needed.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Appreciated the provision of lightning in the park, which will secure family visits at night timing as well. 	No response required.	No action needed.

Consultation Based Design Modification Matrix for **Redevelopment of Kharadar Locality:**

Name	Feedback/Comments	Action to be taken	Design Modifications
Background information of the Redevelopment of Kharadar Locality sub-project shared with the participants during consultation process	She suggested that there are no separate toilets for ladies in the public places, so the designs must ensure separate provision of female toilet in park.	The separate toilets will be provided.	The provisions of toilets incorporated in the design.
	She emphasized that there should be basic provisions for females such as areas which enable them to conduct meetings, get-togethers and other recreational programs. Consultant team informed the proposed provisions in Allah Rakha Park can be utilized for such meetings.	Allah Rakha Park will be provided with open space for meetings and get-togethers.	The provisions of open space incorporated in the design.
	Suggested to rehabilitate the Allah Rakha Park with provisions to facilitate family visitations.	Allah Rakha Park will be rehabilitated with provisions to facilitate family scale visitation.	The rehabilitation of Allah Rakha Park included in the design.
	Suggested proper lightening and CCTV cameras in park, enabling females to safely visit the park.	The design caters with proper lightening and CCTV camera arrangements.	Design provided lightening and CCTV camera arrangements.
	She suggested to include provision of lightening on the streets.	The design caters with proper lightening on the streets.	Design provided lightening and CCTV camera arrangements.
	She suggested to improve the sewerage system of the area and placement of the waste dustbins in the public places.	The respondents were briefed about the proposed inventions and informed them that the concerned departments are working on to improve the sewerage system in the area.	Design caters to increase the Waste dustbins in the sub-project area.
	She emphasized that there is no proper route for the ambulances which increases the death ratio in the area.	The respondent was told that the proposed construction of roads will improve vehicular movement in the area which will subsequently resolve such delays.	Improvements on road will improve vehicular movement.
	She suggested the pedestrian paths should be wide and designed to avoid slip and trip.	The design caters with improvement of footpaths and design will be based on best practices to avoid slip and trip.	Design provided cater with the improvement of footpaths.
	Appreciated the design and informed that the capacity of existing water and sewerage lines passing near police choki are choked.	KWSB will be taken on board.	No any design modification is required.



Name	Feedback/Comments	Action to be taken	Design Modifications
	<p>Suggested to include urban spaces development including; provision of lightening and footpaths at Mulji Street and Bagh-e-Zehra Street</p> <p>Installation of signage for one-way traffic management i.e. In towards Kharadar from Mulji Street, and Out from Kharadar from Bagh-e-Zehra Street and maintaining two way traffic flow at Bakhira Street.</p>	<p>The urban spaces development works may be included in the proposed after discussion with the technical teams of Consultants.</p> <p>Since the community leaders are already in coordination with the Traffic Police for appointing Traffic Wardens in order to maintain one-way traffic mechanism. Further contractor and consultant will join hands mobilization of dwellers about traffic and installation of one-way signage.</p>	<p>No any design modification would be needed, because the suggested works are manageable within the BOQ items finalized for Kharadar Sub-project.</p>
	<p>Before starting works on the proposes monument, the management committee of Bukhari Mosque should be once again consulted, because at the open piece of land the funeral prayer (a part of the Islamic funeral ritual) is performed.</p>	<p>The consultants had already meeting within the premises of Bukhari Mosque and community appreciated the plan.</p>	<p>No any modification in designs is needed. However re-consultation with the management committee of Bukhari Mosque will make a way either or not to include the monument</p>
	<p>Appreciated the final designs of the Kharadar Sub-project.</p>	<p>No response needed.</p>	<p>No action needed</p>
	<p>There is non-designated dumping of solid waste in north-eastern side of Allah Rakha Park. The proper solid waste disposal is not followed.</p>	<p>The coordination meeting with the Sindh Solid Waste Management Board-South to be conducted.</p> <p>The coordination between DMC & SSWMB will be enhanced.</p>	<p>Although Park has a separate area and designs do not need any modification. It is matter of only civic sense of local people and proper implementation of solid waste management cycle.</p>
	<p>Appreciated the design and different themes.</p>	<p>No response required.</p>	<p>No modification in designs is anticipated.</p>
	<p>Proper lightening and sitting arrangements in parks</p>	<p>Proper lightening and sitting arrangements in parks</p>	<p>Proper lightening and sitting arrangements in parks</p>
	<p>The design caters with proper sitting and lighting arrangements.</p>	<p>The design caters with proper sitting and lighting arrangements.</p>	<p>The design caters with proper sitting and lighting arrangements.</p>
	<p>Provision of proper lightening improvement and sitting arrangements at Allah Rakha Park</p>	<p>The designs already caters provision of lightening and improved sitting arrangements.</p>	<p>No modification</p>



Name	Feedback/Comments	Action to be taken	Design Modifications
	Proper security system for women and children, visiting the Allah Rakha Park and provision of lightening system	The coordination with DMC in this connection will be ensured.	The street lights are already included in designs. No modification is needed.
	Provision of Public Toilet at Park	The public toilets separate for male, female and handicapped persons is already included in designs.	No response needed.
	They were mainly concerned due to existing issue of car/bikes parking in the area and suggested interventions to have provisions of proper parking.	They were informed about the sub-project proposed provisions not likely to have parking interventions. However the proposed intervention will subsequently improve parking in the sub-project area.	Design to improve street roads, footpaths are likely parking in the area.
	The poor drainage system causes mobility issues for consumers.	They were briefed about the proposed inventions and informed them that the concerned departments are working on to improve the sewerage system in the area.	Design modification not anticipated.
	The business related persons had concerns about construction works causing traffic congestion, dust and noise pollution, restricted access or temporary issues to pedestrians, residents and business community etc.	The business persons were responded that although the impacts are temporary in nature and for the minimal period till the sub-project is implemented.	The implementation of construction works would be supported through effective mitigation measures.

Pictorial Evidence:

Redevelopment of Kakri Sports Complex and Neighborhood Improvement

	
Consultation with local Residents	
	
Consultations with Sports Person at Kakri Playground	
	
Consultations with Business Owners	
	
Consultations with Mobile Vendors and Small Cart Owners	



Consultation Meeting with Kakri Football and Boxing Associations/Clubs



Meetings with Government Departments and Utility Services



Consultation Meeting with Advisory Group including Architects and Urban Planners



Consultants briefing the layout plan of the proposed park and noting the feedback from participants



Consultants taking feedback from participants while briefing layout plan of the proposed Fish Market



Briefing regarding modification in design by Consultants and ESRU Team-PIU-KNP



Participants of from relevant groups of stakeholders



Participants agreeing the designs

Redevelopment of Kharadar Locality





Consultations with Mobile Vendors



The community leaders and social workers being presented about, final design features of Kharadar Sub-project



Taking suggestion from the participants



Meetings with Government Departments





Consultation Meeting with Advisory Group including well known Architects and Urban Planner