



Report

Stakeholders Consultation Phase-II Sub- Projects

Redevelopment of Neighborhood Roads and Upgradation of Open Spaces including Playgrounds and Parks, Malir Cluster

**KARACHI NEIGHBORHOOD IMPROVEMENT PROJECT,
PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION UNIT (PIU)
PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT GOVERNMENT OF
SINDH**

Introduction

Karachi Neighborhood Improvement Project (KNIP) believes in inclusive approach for implementation of the sub-projects. In this regard, Public Consultation (PC) with stakeholders conducted in line with Work Bank’s Operational Policy and Procedures. Stakeholders’ Engagement is an integral part for meaningful consultation with the relevant stakeholders.

Public consultation has taken place to disseminate information about sub-project conceptual and final design along with proposed interventions with the stakeholders for their input and suggestions.

The consultative meetings were conducted with group of Stakeholders to inform them about the final design through presentations and display of 3D models, so that the feedback received is addressed at an early stage. This process will continue through all stages of the sub-project in order to accommodate stakeholders' aspirations and to orient the stakeholders positively towards the project implementation in order to facilitate timely completion.

This report presents the findings of consultations carried out for following sub-projects:

- **Redevelopment of Neighborhood Roads and Upgradation of Open Spaces including Playgrounds and Parks in Malir Cluster**

The total number of participants of the consultation along with breakdown of target group is tabulated below:

S. #	Sub- Project	Target Group														Total	Male	Female
		Resident		Trader / Business Owner		Govt Departments/ Technical		Mobile Vendors		NGO / CBO		Sports / Youth		Artists & Experts				
		M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F			
1	Redevelopment of Neighborhood Roads and Upgradation of Open Spaces including Grounds and Parks in Malir Cluster	252	125	11	0	41	9	18	0	40	4	57	4	0	0	561	419	142
Target Group - Total		561	561	561	561	561	561	561	561	561	561	561	561	561	561	561	561	561
Target Group - %		45%	22%	2%	0%	7%	2%	3%	0%	7%	1%	10%	1%	0%	0%	100%	75%	25%
Gender No.		Men				419				Women				142				
Gender Wise %		Men				75%				Women				25%				

The participants in general appreciated the proposed design, however few issues/concerns discussed during consultative meeting is provided as follows;

1. Findings of the Consultative Meetings with Local Residents, Social Workers and Sports Persons @ Govt. Boys Secondary School Sahibdad Baloach Goth (Male and Female Groups) for Pir Mahfooz Football Ground. The summary of the issues/concerns and suggestions is provided in the table below;

S. No.	Name	Category	Recommendation/Suggestions	Response to Comment
1	Muhammad Ramzan	Resident	He appreciated the proposed design and efforts of team to brief the residents. He informed that road safety features may inculcated for the safety of residents specially students who usually walk from home to school.	The safety signs are included in the design and crossings near schools will be provided with speed breaks. Also provision of Zebra crossing is included in the design near schools.
2	Allah Bux	Resident	He informed that the area is neglected with reference to proper utilization of the open spaces for recreational activities. The proposed interventions are most likely to improve the liveability of the residents. He suggested the construction activity may be planned in manner to avoid disturbance to the residents.	The anticipated impacts associated with the construction activities are assessed and mitigation measures are suggested in ESMP to minimize the impact as low as reasonably practicable (ALARP).
3	Altaf Hussain	Resident	He appreciated the designs of proposed interventions and suggested that there should be a mechanism in place to record and resolve residents issue, if any.	The mechanism is in place Grievance Redressal Mechanism (GRM) to record and resolve such issues.
4	Kamran Soomro	Resident	He suggested plantation of trees along the roads and parks/grounds and avoid cutting of existing trees.	The inventory of existing trees is maintained and cutting of existing trees in not envisaged. However the project proposes the plantation of 770 plant saplings.
5	Murad Bux	Resident	He emphasized on need to provide facilities like potable water in parks/grounds.	The water treatment units are proposed to provide potable to the players and visitors.
6	Mahnoor Baloch	Resident	She informed that the area is neglected with reference to proper utilization of the open spaces for recreational activities. She suggested proper utilization of open spaces will definitely improve the Liveability of surrounding area. She emphasized on early start of the proposed intervention and timely completion, enabling the residents to get maximum benefit.	The project is in its final stage and the construction activity will be scheduled in manner to timely complete the project interventions.
7	Saira Bano	Resident	She appreciated the designs of	The design caters with the

S. No.	Name	Category	Recommendation/Suggestions	Response to Comment
	Baloch`		proposed interventions and suggested to female toilets in the interventions parks and grounds.	requirements such as separate toilets for females in the proposed interventions.
8	Rasheeda	Resident	Suggested to include provision to lightening in ground/parks/roads, which will secure women mobility at night time as well.	The design caters with the requirement of proper lighting.
9	Mehar Bibi	Resident	She emphasized on need to provide basic facilities for disabled in parks and grounds to facilitate their visitation.	Universal design concept is used to ease accessibility for people with disabilities
10	Sobia Nawaz	Resident	She suggested that there should be proper route for locals so that they can reach easily without any hurdle to the ground.	The footpaths and access roads are included in the sub-project which will eventually ease the movement in the area.
11	Benazir	Resident	She suggested revamping of sewerage system along the proposed roads.	The interventions include rehabilitation of sewerage system along the proposed roads. The sewerage lines are proposed to be underground to avoid naissance to the residents.
12	Saba	Resident	She highly appreciated the subproject. She suggested alternate route to commute during construction of roads.	The alternate routes will be suggested during construction phase in consultation with local traffic police to avoid disturbance to the residents



(a) Consultation with Female Group @ GBSS-Sahibdad Goth for Pir Mahfooz Football Ground



(b) Consultation with Female Group @ GBSS-Sahibdad Goth for Pir Mahfooz Football Ground

2. Consultative Meetings with Local Residents, Social Workers and Sports Persons (Male and Female Groups) for Young Iqbal Football and Friends Cricket Grounds and Road works as sub-components of Malir Cluster was conducted @ Kachi Muslim Mandhira Jamiat Hall Hingora Goth and Otaq of Baba Younis Gharibabad. The summary of the

issues/concerns and suggestions is provided in the table below;

S. No.	Name	Category	Recommendation/Suggestions	Response to Comment
1	Peer Muhammad	Resident	Highly appreciated the proposed design, however suggested timely completion of the work to facilitate users.	The activities will be planned as scheduled and monitored to check compliance with target dates.
2	Ahmed Ali	Resident	He emphasized on providing skilled and unskilled jobs to residents.	Preference for skill and unskilled jobs will be given to residents.
3	Din Muhammad	Resident	He appreciated the proposed interventions and suggested to have adequate waste bins in parks /grounds to cater with waste issues in the existing parks/grounds.	The proposed design caters with the requirements.
4	Ameer Bux	Resident	He suggested proper mitigation measures to avoid excessive dust during construction phase.	The mitigation measures are suggested in the ESMP to minimize dust. Further the team will monitor the construction activity to ensure compliance of the mitigation measures. .
5	Muhammad Ramzan	Resident	He emphasized on beautification of the parks/grounds/streets through plantation.	The project proposes plantation of 770 plant saplings in the area
6	Usman Ghani	Resident	He appreciated the proposed design. However, informed that the area lacks with a proper community hall where the residents could arrange small gatherings and ceremonials. The residents have also formally requested to the DMC which is working on this as well.	The proposed interventions caters with the basic requirements to improve recreational activities and family scale visitations.
7	Ahmed	Resident	He suggested that the boundary wall of Young Football Ground be designed to avoid nearby residential area.	The boundary is designed to avoid residential area.
8	Kainat	Resident	She informed that the sewerage and water lines are available in Young football ground which may be connected with the main system.	The new sewerage and water lines will be connected to the main system.
9	Zainab	Resident	She suggested that there should be separate sewerage and water lines for the family park.	The new sewerage line is in the scope and will be provided.
10	Asghar Ali	Resident	He suggested to include provision to lightening in the ground/park, which will secure women mobility at night time as well.	The design caters with the requirement of proper lighting.
11	Nadia	Resident	She suggested that there should be separate toilets for females in the family park.	The separate toilets are provided.

S. No.	Name	Category	Recommendation/Suggestions	Response to Comment
12	M.Younis	Resident	He emphasized on the installation of CCTV cameras in the family park.	The design caters with the requirement.
13	Aslam	Resident	He suggested that there is load shading in the area. There should be electricity backup in the ground/park.	Generators are planned to be installed in ground/park.



(a) Consultative Meeting with Male group @ Kachi Muslim Mandhira Jamiat Hall Hingora Goth for Young Iqbal Football and Friends Cricket Grounds, Malir Cluster



(b) Consultative Meeting with Male & Female (Joint Group) @ Otaq of Baba Younis Gharibabad for Young Iqbal Football and Friends Cricket Grounds, Malir Cluster

3. Consultative Meetings with Local Residents, Social Workers, Government Officials and Youth (Male and Female Groups) for Shaheed Muhammad Khashkeli Park and Library and Road works as sub-components of Malir Cluster The summary of the issues/concerns and suggestions is provided in the table below;

S. No.	Name	Category	Recommendation/Suggestions	Response to Comment
1	Nazir Ahmed Memon	Residents	He informed that the name of the park must checked and refer the official name in the documents.	Consultant has rechecked and officially name of park is Shaheed Muhammad Khashkeli Park.
2	Wajid Hussain	Residents	He appreciated the design and suggested proper supervision to have replica of the design on ground.	The project will be supervised and monitored to have the same on ground.
3	Qadir Bux	Residents	He suggested different time for male and females to play in the grounds.	The management committee will be formed which will look into these suggestions. However, basic facilities for females are provided in the grounds to facilitate womenfolk of the area.
4	Inayatullah	Residents	He suggested monitoring of the project	The activities will be

S. No.	Name	Category	Recommendation/Suggestions	Response to Comment
	Qambrani		during construction phase to avoid disturbance to residents.	monitored to check compliance with the suggested mitigation measures in ESMP.
5	Muhammad Musa	Residents	Suggested implementation of the project schedule to avoid delay in the execution of project.	The project schedule will be monitored to avoid delays.
6	Haleema Suleman	Resident	She emphasized on the maintenance of the grounds/parks after completion of the work.	The Operation and Maintenance (O&M) is part of the sub-project for the sustainability of the project.
7	Samina Shahid	Resident	She appreciated the proposed designs and suggested that the women in the project area is mostly are housewives. Therefore, could get the maximum benefits of specially parks to walk and have family scale visitations subject to availability of basic facilities. . .	The parks are provided with separate basic facilities to facilitate womenfolk visitation
8	Kulsoom	Resident	She appreciated the interventions which will be beneficial for the residents. However, informed that the major issue being faced by residents is load shedding, availability of water and gas in the area.	The new water supply lines are proposed to improve the water supply system in the area.
9	Areeba	Resident	She suggested proper lighting in grounds/parks, to facilitate female movement at night time as well.	The design caters with the requirements.
10	Kulsom	Resident	She appreciated the intervention to include Library which would be beneficial for residents of the area. However, informed that currently this place is uninhabited and used by drug addicts..	The sub-project interventions will improve the liveability of the area.
11	Shahida	Resident	She appreciated the Intervention and proposed design. She suggested to focus on revamping dispensaries and hospitals which requires maintenance and rehabilitation.	Keeping in view availability of uninhabited open spaces, interventions were proposed to improve family scale visitations such as parks/grounds and library to help.
12	Bilqees	Resident	She appreciated the interventions which will be beneficial for the residents. However, she raised concerned about the load shading of gas in the area.	Consultant informed that this is not part of the interventions.
13	Aqsa	Resident	She emphasized on the security problems restricting residents to visit	CCTVs are proposed along with controlled gates to enter

S. No.	Name	Category	Recommendation/Suggestions	Response to Comment
			parks. .	and exit.
14	Nimra	Resident	She appreciated the proposed designs and suggested separate sitting arrangement for women in the library.	The design caters with the requirements.
15	Parveen	Resident	She was concerned that there should be a separate entrance gate for women so that they can easily enter and exit the library.	The suggestion is noted and will be added in the construction drawing.
16	Aneela Qayoom	Resident	She emphasized that the park should be used only for family and kids otherwise, it will again be in the hands of drug addicts.	The proposed park is family park.
17	Saba	Resident	She emphasized that sometimes there is load shading in the area. There should be electricity backup in the ground/park.	Generators is planned to be installed in ground/park.



(a) Consultative Meeting with Female Group for Shaheed Muhammad Khashkeli Park and Library, Malir Cluster



(b) Consultative Meeting with Female Group for Shaheed Muhammad Khashkeli Park and Library, Malir Cluster

4. Consultative Meetings with Local Residents, Social Workers, Media Persons and Youth Group (Male and Female Groups) for Aabishaar Park @ Dispensary Beside Abshar Park, Khkhirapar No. 4, Malir. The summary of the issues/concerns and suggestions is provided in the table below;

S. No.	Name	Category	Recommendation/Suggestions	Response to Comment
1	Mr. Din Muhammad	Resident	He highly appreciated the design of the Abshar Park but suggested boundary wall for security purpose.	The design caters with the requirement.
2	Mr. Irfan	Resident	He emphasized on the issue of the wastewater which accumulates on	The new sewerage system is included in the design.

S. No.	Name	Category	Recommendation/Suggestions	Response to Comment
			streets due to old system of sewerage.	
3	Waqar Khan	Resident	He appreciated the sub-project of the Malir cluster and suggests that there should be guard for security purpose.	The controlled entrance and exit gates will be provided along with CCTV Camera for security reasons.
4	Muhammad Yasin	Resident	He appreciated the sub-project of Abshar Park and suggested to have proper lighting, enabling womenfolk safety visit the parks.	The design caters with the requirements.
5	Mr. Ghayour	Resident	He suggested that construction activities be planned to minimize its impacts to the residents.	Impact assessment carried out to identify anticipated impacts during construction phase and mitigation measures suggested to minimize impacts in the ESMP.
6	Azmi Khan	Resident	He suggested operational and maintenance budget after completion of the project.	The O&M budget is proposed for the sustainability of the project.
7	Noman Qudoos	Resident	He emphasized on the installation of CCTV cameras in the Abshar park with entrance and exist control management.	The design caters with the requirements.
8	Kalsum	Resident	She appreciated the efforts of consultant for briefing the proposed design of the interventions. This practice is never witnessed before in this area.	As per World Bank policy, the design is to be shared with the male and female residents of the area to record their views/concerns, if any, to be addressed at an early stage.
9	Shazia	Resident	She appreciated the proposed designs and informed that due to lack of facilities this park is currently used by the drug addicts.	The redevelopment of Abshar Park will definitely promote healthy activities which will eventually improve the living conditions of residents.
10	Farzana	Resident	She appreciated the interventions which will be beneficial for the residents. However, she suggested locals to be considered for employment.	Preference will be given to locals for skilled and unskilled jobs.
11	Shumaila	Resident	She suggested timely completion of the activates, enabling residents to get maximum benefit of the facilities.	Project schedule will be followed and monitored for timely completion of the activities.
12	Sumera		She emphasized that the ground should be designed with drainage system to avoid accumulation of rain water.	The grounds/parks will be provided with drainage network to avoid accumulation of water during rain.
13	Naila		She appreciated the proposed designs	The lighting is already planned in

S. No.	Name	Category	Recommendation/Suggestions	Response to Comment
			and was concerned about the lighting system in the ground.	the interventions of sub-project.
14	Saba Jilani		She suggested CCTV cameras in the parks for the security purpose.	The design caters with the requirement.
15	Kinza		She emphasized that there should be some rides and swings in the ground.	The design caters with the requirement.
16	Amina		She emphasized that sometimes there is load shading in the area. There should be electricity backup in the ground/park.	Consultant informed that the provision of generators available.



(a) Consultative Meeting with Male Group for Aabishaar Park, Malir Cluster



(b) Consultative Meeting with Female Group for Aabishaar Park, Malir Cluster

5. Consultative Meeting with Male and Female Local Residents, Social Workers, Media Persons and Youth Group for Shaheen Park, UC # 12, Gharibabad for Shaheen Park and Road works as sub-components of Malir Cluster. No any concern was raised by the participants.



(a) Consultative Meeting with Male Group for Shaheen Park, Malir Cluster



(b) Consultative Meeting with Female Group for Shaheen Park, Malir Cluster

6. Consultative Meeting with Male and Female Local Residents, Social Workers, Media Persons and Youth Group for Madina Park and Eidgah and Road works as sub-components of Malir Cluster. The summary of the issues/concerns and suggestions is provided in the table below;

S. No.	Name	Category	Recommendation/Suggestions	Response to Comment
1	Mr. Muhammad Umer	NGOs / CBOs: Vice President Madina Masjid Committee	He highly appreciated the sub-project of Malir, besides that he suggested to relocate the entrance of Eidgah linear to the main gate of Madina Masjid.	The suggestion is noted and will revise our drawing accordingly.
2	Mr. Muhammad Aneel	Resident	He highly appreciated the sub-project and suggested that there was lack of any recreational place in the area. The family park would be very beneficial for the residents.	The interventions are planned to improve family scale visitations.
3	Mr. Muhammad Iqbal Kachi	NGOs / CBOs: Social Worker	He highly appreciated the sub-project of Malir, besides that he suggested that there should be provision of community hall at one side of proposed park.	The proposed interventions caters with the basic requirements to improve recreational activities and family scale visitations.
4	Mr. Habib Rehman	Resident	He appreciated the proposed interventions and suggested to have adequate waste bins in parks /grounds to cater with waste issues in the existing parks/grounds.	The proposed design caters with the requirements.
5	Mr. Muhammad Younis	Mr. Muhammad Younis	He highly appreciated the design of the Madina Park and Eidgah, but suggested that rear wall of the park and Eidgah may be provided with complete concrete wall instead of iron grills. However, iron grill should be provided in front and side walls, this was suggested to observe pardah from main road.	The suggestions is noted and the boundary wall will be provided.
6	Mr. Muhammad Isamil	Resident	He suggested that there should be proper route for locals so that they can reach easily without any hurdle to the ground.	The footpaths and access roads are included in the sub-project which will eventually ease the movement in the area.
7	Mr. Muhammad Hussain	Resident	He emphasized on the poor sewerage system in the area, the water remains on streets and road for several days which hampers the mobility of residents. He suggested the sewerage system should be	The interventions include rehabilitation of sewerage system along the proposed roads. The sewerage lines are proposed to be underground to avoid nuisance to the residents.

S. No.	Name	Category	Recommendation/Suggestions	Response to Comment
			made underground.	
8	Mr. Abdul Ghani	Resident	He suggested that the residents should be given responsibility to own the grounds and parks and to maintain the areas which are included in the sub-project proposed design.	The committee will comprise of the locals with DMC officials to maintain the park and Eidgah.



Consultative Meeting with Local Residents, Social Workers and Sports Persons for Madina Park, Eidgah and Road works, Malir Cluster